A comparative systematic literature review between Indonesia and Malaysia Halal tourism studies (2010-2022)

Azhar Alam\textsuperscript{a}\textsuperscript{*} | Ririn Tri Ratnasari\textsuperscript{b} | Muhamad Nafik Hadi Ryandono\textsuperscript{b} | Ari Prasetyo\textsuperscript{a} | Yasmin Syahidah\textsuperscript{a} | Faiz Adib Bafana\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a}Department of Islamic Economic Laws, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Indonesia. \\
\textsuperscript{b}Department of Islamic Economics, Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia.

Abstract: Indonesia and Malaysia publish halal tourism studies and are concerned about promoting the market. This qualitative systematic literature review study uses PRISMA to identify, accept, and reject studies. The study authors had to be from Indonesia and Malaysia, and it had to be on halal tourism in those countries. A total of 216 studies were collected using the Scopus database, leaving 79 studies consisting of 61 Indonesian studies and 18 Malaysian studies that met the selection criteria. The results of the assessment and comparison of the 79 studies that were successfully collected show that the earliest Malaysian halal travel study was published in 2011 and reached the peak of the study trend in 2020, while the earliest Indonesian halal travel study was published in 2017 and reached the peak of the study trend in 2021. The study framework that is most widely used by studies of the two countries is Customer Behavior. The Malaysian halal tourism study theme is dominated by the hospitality study theme, while the Indonesian halal tourism study is dominated by the tourist behavior theme. In addition, it was found that there are many themes in Indonesian halal tourism studies that have not been found in Malaysian halal tourism studies, such as themes of local Islamic wisdom, halal tourism technology, regulations, and studies on tourism development in a destination. In Indonesian halal tourism research, Kalimantan is not mentioned. These themes can be opportunities for future and development of halal tourism studies.

Keywords: halal tourism, systematic literature, Indonesia, Malaysia, SLR comparison

1. Introduction

The tourism sector is one of the fastest-growing economic sectors. This sector has a significant influence on job growth and the world economy (Mariyono, 2017). At the national level, the tourism sector has a tremendous influence on increasing local income through retribution and per capita income (Fafurida & Ni’mah, 2017). Until recently, the tourism sector has continued to grow in creating concepts following global needs and trends, one of which is halal tourism (Susilawati, 2023). This halal tourism trend is inseparable from the increase in the world’s Muslim population, which is predicted to increase to 30% of the world’s total population by 2050 (Pew Research 2015). As a result of the increase in the Muslim population, the need for the concept of halal tourism has also increased (Alam et al., 2023ab).

Halal tourism is a form of innovation from the tourism sector created to meet Muslim tourists’ needs when traveling. Increasing people’s religious awareness demands the fulfillment of the meaning of halal in every aspect of life, one of which is in tourist trips (Fathoni & Muthoifin, 2020). During its development, halal tourism cannot be separated from religious and sharia tourism, which later developed into halal tourism (Jaelani, 2017). In contrast to religious tourism and sharia tourism, which are synonymous with spiritual experiences, Mohsin et al., (2016) argue that halal tourism involves the availability of tourism products and facilities that can meet the needs of Muslim tourists for worship and halal food needs. Halal tourism allows a Muslim to travel while still concerned about his essential Muslim obligations (Ramadhani & Mochklas, 2019).

The Indonesian Ministry of Tourism and MUI has established halal tourism criteria containing nine principles, namely, (1) oriented toward the benefit of the people; (2) oriented toward enlightenment, refreshment, and tranquility; (3) avoiding idolatry and superstition; (4) avoiding immoral acts; (5) maintaining human behavior, ethics, and values; (6) maintaining trust, security and comfort; (7) being universal and inclusive; (8) protecting the environment; and (9) considering social, cultural and local wisdom values (Hakim et al., 2017).

Halal tourism has become a trend in the tourism sector with promising prospects (Yulitasari et al., 2020). Based on a report released by the Mastercard-Crescent Global Muslim Travel Index in 2022, the number of Muslim tourists will reach 140 million in 2023 and continue to increase until it reaches 230 million in 2028 (Mastercard-Crescentrating 2022). In addition, a
Global Islamic Economy Report states that halal tourism’s economic turnover will increase to US$ 274 billion by 2023 (Kemenparekraf/Baparekraf RI 2021). This potential has encouraged many countries to start developing the concept of halal tourism. These are not only members of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) but also non-OIC countries such as Singapore and Thailand. Muslim majority countries such as Indonesia and Malaysia have great potential for developing halal tourism. The development of halal tourism in these two countries can be said to be relatively rapid.

The development of halal tourism in Indonesia began in 2012, and halal tourism was given priority by the Minister of Tourism in 2015. Tourism in Indonesia is included in the priority development program of the 2015-2019 Working Cabinet. Along with this program, the Indonesian government is also trying to develop halal tourism by forming a team to accelerate its development. In 2019, according to the GMTI, Indonesia managed to rank first as the best halal tourist destination country, side by side with Malaysia (Mastercard-CrescentRating 2019). To strengthen halal tourism, the Indonesian Ministry of Tourism collaborated with the Crescent Rating Mastercard. The Indonesia Muslim Travel Index (IMTI) was used to disect the advantages and weaknesses of halal tourism in every region of Indonesia (Sayekti, 2019). According to the IMTI 2019 report, the three best tourist destinations in Indonesia are Lombok, Aceh, and the Riau Islands (Indonesia Muslim Travel Index (IMTI) 2022).

Halal tourism in Malaysia began after the September 11 terrorist attacks in the U.S. Malaysia is one of the favorite destinations for Muslim tourists looking for new destinations in the East. Malaysia managed to rank first as the best halal tourist destination according to the GMTI consecutively since 2015-2022. To develop halal tourism, Malaysia is preparing the Halal Masterplan, which has a target of 13 years and covers three phases. In the first phase (2008-2010), Malaysia was developed as a world hub for halal integrity and prepared for industry growth; in the second phase (2011-2015), Malaysia became one of the favorite locations for halal businesses; and in the third phase (2016-2018), the geographical footprint of domestic halal companies was expanded (Satriana & Faridah, 2018). Malaysia aggressively promotes halal tourism to Muslim tourists, especially Middle Eastern Muslims. Malaysia has made various policies and adjustments to attract tourists, such as building roads in Ain Arabia in Kuala Lumpur, serving Middle Eastern cuisine, using Arabic on signage, providing Arabic staff, and providing Arabic radio and television channels in Arabic at the hotel (Shafaei & Mohamed, 2015).

Indonesia and Malaysia have many similarities in various aspects, both in terms of geographical location in Southeast Asia and in terms of the religion of the majority of the population, which is Islam. In addition, these two countries are also very concerned about the development of halal tourism and are very productive countries in publishing halal tourism studies. A bibliometric study titled A Bibliometric Analysis of Halal and Islamic Tourism revealed that the country that published the most halal tourism studies through Scopus from 2004-2021 was Malaysia, with 86 papers, followed by Indonesia, with 64 papers (Suban, et al., 2021). In addition, in the Publication Trends on Halal Tourism: A Bibliometric Review compiled through Scopus showed that Indonesia was the country that published the most studies related to halal tourism, with as many as 42 papers, and Malaysia published as many as 29 papers (Abdullah, 2021).

Previous studies on halal tourism have used systematic literature review methods. For example, Apostle (2019) studied trends, opportunities, and challenges in halal tourism. The study also used PRISMA as a technique for the acceptance and rejection of articles. PRISMA is used in systematic review studies and meta-analyses as a list and flow diagram that provides transparent visualization of the article selection process. The PRISMA guidelines are based on the 2020 PRISMA statement by Page et al. (2021). Although there have been several studies with the same theme of halal tourism studies and methods, there has not been a systematic literature review that compares studies from two countries and offers study opportunities based on the analysis results from the collected studies.

Based on these findings, this study seeks to map studies that have been conducted by researchers from Indonesia and Malaysia related to the topic of halal tourism to determine similarities and differences in the extent of studies on halal tourism that have been carried out by researchers from these two countries and contribute to the direction of study opportunities that have not been carried out by researchers from these two countries so that they can develop halal tourism.

2. Materials and Methods

Reza (2020) examined halal tourism in Indonesia's economic development. The study was conducted qualitatively, and the data were collected. This study showed that Indonesia has great potential for developing its tourism sector and halal tourism to develop its economy. Tourism is beneficial for the surrounding community and provides foreign exchange income for the country, increasing the economy. This benefit should be the concern of the government and the community. Because halal tourism cannot stand alone, cooperation from various parties, such as the halal industry and financing institutions, is needed.

Winarti (2017) studied halal tourism in Indonesia using the literature review method. The study concluded that Indonesia's halal tourism marketing efforts, namely, "Indonesia The Halal Wonders," could also have a negative effect, namely, losing non-Muslim tourists. Therefore, to attract non-Muslim tourists, the government must also pay attention to the psychological side of marketing. Halal tourism marketing must be performed by placing Islam as a culture, not as a religion, so that it can be enjoyed by non-Muslims who have the exact needs of Muslims, for example, halal food whose
process is guaranteed to be clean and good. This type of marketing will then be able to attract non-Muslim tourists to engage in halal tourism.

Churiyah et al. (2021) conducted literature studies to research halal tourism and its implementation and what needs to be developed in Indonesia. This study explains that Indonesia has great potential for preventing the development of halal tourism in Indonesia from challenging even though it still has many obstacles. Although some regions in Indonesia have received halal tourism awards, this is not in line with the development of institutions and infrastructure to support these regions. Therefore, the state must support the demand and needs of Muslim tourists and provide understanding to businesspeople to help develop halal tourism. Some things that need to be considered by the Indonesian government in developing halal tourism include implementing halal tourism, namely, providing facilities that are met with Muslim needs, developing human resources, determining halal tourism areas, and promoting and projecting halal tourism for non-Muslim tourists.

Peristiwo (2020) studied halal tourism's potential in Indonesia and Malaysia. This study was conducted using a qualitative approach with analytical methods. This study reveals that Indonesia and Malaysia have great potential for developing halal tourism. One of the foundations is the religion of the majority of the Muslim population. The natural wealth of these two countries is also an attraction and opportunity for the tourism sector, especially for halal tourism. In addition, providing tourist facilities for Muslim tourists should also not be difficult because Islamic religious practices have been applied in the daily lives of the community. Despite competing with non-Muslim countries in developing halal tourism, the application of halal tourism in non-Muslim countries only creates a Muslim-friendly atmosphere. In this case, Indonesia and Malaysia have an advantage.

Nurrachmi (2019) conducted literature studies to determine the potential of the tourism industry in Southeast Asia. The study showed that Malaysia is the most developed ASEAN country in terms of halal tourism, followed by Indonesia and Thailand. Islamic tourism in the ASEAN has an excellent opportunity to become a source of state income. Although countries in ASEAN countries have different characteristics in terms of cultural, social, economic, and natural resources, they all have the same goals: increasing state income and creating jobs for their citizens to achieve economic improvement. Therefore, to attract tourists, in addition to the image of the destination, the quality of service, religious motivation, and attractive promotions, such as cooperation between ASEAN countries, are needed.

Samori, Md Salleh, & Khalid (2015) studied the latest trends in halal tourism in several Asian countries. The study was conducted using qualitative methods and literature data collection techniques. The halal tourism industry in Asia discussed in this study involves a nonconservative Muslim country, Malaysia, and a non-Muslim country, Japan. Halal tourism in Malaysia has continued to grow consistently since 2001. This growth is due to the efforts of the Malaysian government to develop halal tourism, such as promoting and preparing Islamic infrastructure, regulations, and activities. Halal tourism is also proliferating in Japan, where Muslim visitors continue to increase, and the Japanese government supports the construction of supporting facilities for Muslim tourists.

Yagmur et al. (2019) conducted a bibliometric method for halal tourism evaluation, conducted a study by reviewing 60 studies on halal tourism with very long limitations, namely, 1975–2019, collected through the Web of Science Core Collection. This study showed that studies on halal tourism began in 2011 and experienced a rapid increase in 2016. In addition, researchers from Malaysia and Indonesia have conducted studies primarily related to halal tourism. In contrast, the most widely conducted halal study topics are halal or halal hospitality and principles.

Artadita and Hisyam (2021) used the same method used in a bibliometric study examining the evaluation of halal tourism. The limitations of this study include the short duration of the study, namely, ten years from 2011 to 2020. In addition to using bibliometric methods, network and content analyses were also used in this study. Halal tourism studies were collected through Scopus, which produced 230 related studies that were subsequently processed using VOSviewer and Microsoft Excel. The results of this study show that halal tourism studies have increased annually since 2011, and halal tourism has experienced increased popularity and increase since 2015. The study also found keyword connections grouped into three different groups where each had the main keywords, namely, Islamic tourism, tourism, and halal tourism.

Mas’ud and Hamim (2022) also conducted bibliometric studies on halal tourism. This bibliometric study focused only on halal tourism studies performed by researchers from Indonesia. A total of 65 studies were collected through Scopus and analyzed using VOSviewer. The study outlines the characteristics, authors, publications, and subjects related to halal tourism. The most frequently used keywords used in this study include halal tourism, Indonesia, and tourist destinations. Even so, from words that are often used in studies such as halal products, service quality, small Sunda Island, sharia hotels, tourist satisfaction, tourist management, religiosity, halal certification, and fatwas DSN-MUI, halal tourism studies in Indonesia are fairly comprehensive and developed in every field related to halal tourism.

Hidayat et al. (2021) also conducted a bibliometric study of halal tourism. A total of 77 studies were collected from Scopus from 2004–2020. The results of this study show that the trend in the number of publications can be divided into two stages. The first phase, from 2004-2014, was the beginning of the concept of halal tourism, and most halal tourism publications were carried out in 2014. In the second phase, 2014–2020, the trend in halal tourism publications increased by
as much as twice as that in the first phase. Malaysia, followed by Indonesia, published the most halal tourism studies. In comparison, the keywords most often used in 16 years were halal tourism, Islamic tourism, and halal hospitality.

Setyaningsih (2019) Conduct literature studies on halal topics. The study used quantitative methods with data collected from Scopus from 2000–2019. Networking was performed using Publish or Perish (PoP) and VOSviewer using the keyword ‘halal’ and the type of publication in the form of a journal. The results of this study showed that Malaysia is the country with the most prominent halal research, followed by Indonesia. In terms of the keywords used in the title, this study showed that the study of halal concepts is not limited to food and beverages. Since 2010, the topic of halal studies has expanded to other fields, such as halal tourism, cosmetics, pharmaceuticals, and supply chain management.

A systematic literature review was conducted by Yuliviona, Alias, Abdullah & Azliyanti (2019) regarding the relationship between Muslim tourists’ halal tourism, Islamic attributes, experience, satisfaction, and interest in visiting again. Studies are conducted by conducting literature reviews on journal studies, conference proceedings, and books that have related keywords. The results of this study show that tourist satisfaction has a vital role in supporting tourists’ decisions to return to specific tourist destinations. Although tourists also consider facilities, they feel satisfied when the services they receive exceed their needs. Therefore, satisfaction should be used to assess the performance and service of tourist destinations. In addition, several other factors, namely, the availability of halal food, ease of worship facilities, and access to Muslim-friendly family packages, support tourists’ decisions to return to a tourist destination.

The systematic literature review and thematic analysis method was used by Idris, Soetjipto & Kurniawati (2022). The study analyzed 25 studies published from 2010–2021 collected using Science Direct, Scopus, and Google Scholar and PRISMA. The study found that the 25 studies can be grouped into four main themes: marketing strategy, products and services, customer behavior, and business process strategy. In terms of marketing strategy, it was found that infrastructure improvement, the readiness for human resources, and positive, friendly, and open attitudes from residents toward Muslim tourists can increase the desire of tourists to visit again and are excellent strategies for promoting tourist destinations. Halal food and beverages are essential products and services for Muslim tourists, but halal certification is also necessary. Tourist satisfaction with halal tourism depends on facilities that follow Islamic principles. Regarding business process strategy, developing halal tourism requires cooperation between the government and the community for socialization and promotion.

Based on the above literature review, it can be concluded that Indonesia and Malaysia are very productive countries for producing research related to halal tourism. In addition, these two countries are often the objects of halal tourism studies. However, until now, no systematic literature review has shown similarities or differences between the studies produced by the two countries on halal tourism. Therefore, this study will perform a systematic literature review on halal tourism and compare the results of the two countries’ published studies. Hopefully, this study can provide a new direction for halal tourism researchers.

This was a qualitative study in which the literature was reviewed systematically. A systematic literature review identifies, evaluates, and interprets studies by a particular topic, study question, area, or phenomenon of interest (Kitchenham & Charters, 2007). This method can show the breadth of the study and provide a general idea of where studies are different. This approach can also support the success of study objectives. Researchers use PRISMA to assist in study selection, acceptance, or rejection processes. The PRISMA guidelines constitute a minimum set of evidence-based items for reporting in systematic reviews and meta-analyses (PRISMA 2021). All the studies analyzed underwent rigorous and accurate systematic procedures. The analyzed studies were collected from the Scopus database. Scopus was chosen because it is one of the largest indexed databases of scientific publication abstracts covering a wide range of topic areas (Abdullah et al., 2021; Cimini, 2021). Automatically, the only studies collected were English-language studies.

Researchers conducted a literature study with the keyword “halal tourism” in the search box and found 216 studies when accessed on September 19, 2022. Researchers subsequently used the filter feature of selecting countries, namely, Malaysia and Indonesia, and found 130 studies related to the keyword “halal tourism”, specifically for Malaysia and Indonesia. Researchers should not limit the period of studies. The study screening process was then separated into two parts. The first part is devoted to studies related to Malaysia. The second part is specific to studies related to Indonesia. After that, filtering was carried out with the keyword “Malaysia” in the Malaysian halal tourism study section and “Indonesia” in the Indonesian halal tourism study section. In addition, each study was screened according to two criteria: the first criterion was that authors from Malaysia and Indonesia must write the study analyzed, and the second criterion was that the study must specifically discuss halal tourism in Malaysia and Indonesia. The remaining 91 studies were selected. Twenty-one studies discussed Malaysian tourism, and 70 studies discussed Indonesian halal tourism. The final screening yielded 79 studies after 12 studies were released for which data were unavailable.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Development of Halal Tourism Publications by Year

Based on the year of publication of Malaysian and Indonesian halal tourism studies that were successfully collected, the earliest Malaysian halal tourism study was published in 2010 and peaked in 2020. However, the trend of study trends
tends to increase and decrease from 2021–2022. While the earliest published Indonesian halal tourism study was a 2017 study, the trend has continued to increase annually since 2019 until it reached its peak in 2021. Because the study data were collected in September 2022, the trend of Indonesian halal tourism publications can still increase until the end of 2022. The up-and-down trend of Malaysian halal tourism studies is estimated to be due to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the entire world. Policies of lockdown, social distancing, and the closure of recreation and entertainment venues have an impact on reducing the number of tourists and economic decline, one of which is in the tourism sector (Utami & Kafabih, 2021). Due to the COVID-19 pandemic and these policies, the halal tourism sector and tourist destinations have been paralyzed (Chrysnaputra & Pangestoeti, 2021). The paralysis and stagnation of halal tourism are also expected to affect the decline in publications.

3.2. Synthesis Analysis of Quantitative Empirical Studies

Table 1 shows that 30 Malaysian and Indonesian halal tourism studies used quantitative methods. It consists of 5 Malaysian halal tourism studies and 25 Indonesian halal tourism studies. Of the 30 studies, 10 used the SEM method, 8 used the SEM-PLS method, 5 used the PLS method, 3 used multiple linear regression, and 1 used path analysis, CFA, hierarchical
regression, and Pearson's chi-square test. The PLS-SEM method is the most widely used method in Malaysian halal tourism studies, while the SEM is the most widely used method in Indonesian halal tourism studies.

![Figure 1 Comparison of Halal Tourism Publications by Year.](image)

### Table 1 Theoretical Framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theoretical Framework</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Dependent Variables</th>
<th>Independent Variables</th>
<th>Other Variables</th>
<th>Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Isa, Chin, &amp; Mohammad (2018)</td>
<td>Muslim Tourist Satisfaction</td>
<td>Destination Experience</td>
<td></td>
<td>PLS-SEM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zulvianti, Aimon, &amp; Abror (2022)</td>
<td>Tourist Satisfaction</td>
<td>Sustainability Tourism Development, Halal Destination Image</td>
<td></td>
<td>SEM-PLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Juliana, Putri, Wulandari, Saripudin, &amp; Marlina (2022)</td>
<td>Revisit Intention</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction, Attraction Experience, Tourist Satisfaction, perceived value Affective Destination Image, Overall Destination Image</td>
<td></td>
<td>Path Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Suhartanto, Dean, Wibisono, Lu, &amp;; Amin (2022)</td>
<td>Tourist Loyalty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SEM-PLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wibawa, Pranindyasari, Bhawika, &amp;; Mardhotillah (2021)</td>
<td>Revisit Intentions, Recommendation Intentions</td>
<td>Halal Tourism Attributes</td>
<td></td>
<td>SEM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mursid &amp; Wu (2021)</td>
<td>Halal Restaurant Loyalty</td>
<td>Halal Identity Similarity, Halal Identity</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>CFA, Structural Equation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Susantia (2021)</td>
<td>Tourist Loyalty</td>
<td>Push Motivational Factors, Pull Motivational Factors</td>
<td>Tourist Satisfaction</td>
<td>SEM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sumaryadi, Hurriyati, Wibowo, &amp; Gaffar (2021)</td>
<td>Tourist Satisfaction</td>
<td>Quality of Destination Tourism Index</td>
<td>Islamic Attribute of Destination Experience Quality</td>
<td>SEM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rahmati, Oktora,</td>
<td>Revisit Intention</td>
<td>Tourism Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>PLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Independent Variables</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surya, Ginting, Rini, &amp; Absah (2018)</td>
<td>Repeated Visits</td>
<td>Halal Tourism Products, Brand Image Destination</td>
<td>Trust</td>
<td>Multiple Linear Regression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wardi, Abor, &amp; Trinanda (2018)</td>
<td>Word of Mouth (WOM)</td>
<td>Islamic Facilities, Halalness, General Islamic Morality, Alcohol and Gambling Free</td>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abor, Wardi, Trinanda, &amp; Patrisia (2019)</td>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>Halal Tourism, Customer Engagement</td>
<td>Religiosity</td>
<td>Hierarchical Regression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babolian, Hendijani &amp; Sanny (2021)</td>
<td>Satisfaction, intention to revisit</td>
<td>Access, Amenities, Attraction, Satisfaction</td>
<td>Religious faith, Satisfaction, Trip Value</td>
<td>Multiple Linear Regression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rahmat et al. (2022)</td>
<td>Word of Mouth (WOM)</td>
<td>Perception of Halal Tourism Destination, Trip Quality</td>
<td>Experience Quality, Destination Satisfaction</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Battour, Noviyani, Ratnasari, Aboelmaged, &amp; Eid (2022)</td>
<td>Behavioral Intention</td>
<td>Halal Destination Attributes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quantitative Analysis Pearson’s Chi-Square Test</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katuk et al. (2021)</td>
<td>Number of branches the food operators have, Length of the food operator’s businesses, Possession of halal certification</td>
<td>Halal certification possession, Knowledge about halal tourism, Food operators’ perception that Muslim tourist boosted their businesses, food operator’s intention to apply halal certification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vargas-Sanchez, Hariani, &amp; Wijayanti (2020)</td>
<td>Indonesia as a halal tourism destination</td>
<td>Benefits barriers, Religiosity, Attractiveness, Spirit, Ecolog, Healthy Access, Communication, Environment, Service</td>
<td></td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yusuf, Djakfar, Isnialana, &amp; Maulana (2021)</td>
<td>Intention</td>
<td>Communication, Environment, Service</td>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple Linear Regression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zarkasyi, Kurniawan, &amp; Darma (2021)</td>
<td>Interest</td>
<td>Religiosity</td>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td>Multiple Regression Analysis PLS-SEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sudarsono, Shidiqie, &amp; Tumewang (2021)</td>
<td>Intention to Recommend, Intention to Visit</td>
<td>Religiosity, Subjective Norm, Perceived Behavioral Control, Knowledge</td>
<td>Attitude</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumaryadi, Hurriyati, Wibowo, &amp; Gaffar (2020)</td>
<td>Future Travel Intention</td>
<td>Memorable Halal Travel Experience</td>
<td></td>
<td>Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) PLS-SEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suhartanto, Dean, et al. (2021)</td>
<td>Tourist Loyalty</td>
<td>Halal Experience</td>
<td>Experience Quality, Perceived Value, Tourist Satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suhartanto, Gan, Andrianto, (2021)</td>
<td>Intention to Revisit,</td>
<td>Religiosity</td>
<td></td>
<td>PLS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Several theoretical frameworks are used in halal tourism studies that use quantitative methods. Customer behavior theory is the most widely used theory. Fifteen studies, consisting of 2 Malaysian halal tourism studies and 13 Indonesian studies, used this theory. This theory is used by studies that discuss tourist behavior and what things cause tourists to perform certain behaviors, such as loyalty, satisfaction, WOM, and the intention to revisit a tourist destination.

Halal Tourism Theory is the second theory widely used in studying halal tourism. One Malaysian study and three Indonesian halal tourism studies were included. The next theory is the Theory of Planned Behavior, used by four studies, all of which come from Indonesian halal tourism studies. No Malaysian halal tourism study has used this theoretical framework. Furthermore, the Theory of Consumption Value and Brand Theory were used in two studies; the Theory of Consumption Value was found to be used only in Indonesian halal tourism studies and has not been used in Malaysian halal tourism studies. Brand theory is used by one Malaysian study and one Indonesian halal tourism study, where both studies discuss products, services, and brands in halal tourism.

Furthermore, social exchange theory (SET), the technology acceptance model (TAM), and the theory of reasoned action (TRA) were found in only one halal tourism study. SETs have been found only in Malaysian halal tourism studies and not in Indonesian halal tourism studies. In contrast, the TAM and TRA are found only in Indonesian halal tourism studies. This finding shows many study opportunities that researchers from both countries can do. In addition, Malaysian and Indonesian halal tourism researchers can also use grounded theory, as described by Sthapit et al. (2021). This theory has not been found in the studies of the two countries and can be adapted to halal tourism research.

### 3.3 Synthesis analysis in qualitative studies

The qualitative method is still widely used in halal tourism studies. Table 2 shows that 79 studies downloaded data and 49 studies used qualitative methods. Qualitative methods are the choice for studies whose study theme is a description, such as explanations and descriptions of halal tourism, legal sources of halal tourism, and the application of sharia in halal tourism, either from the literature or interviews. In addition, qualitative methods are used by studies that discuss the concept of sharia in the field of hospitality, the creation of geographic information systems in specific tourist destinations, and the elaboration of perceptions and responses of non-Muslims traveling in Muslim countries regarding the application of halal tourism.

### Table 2 Thematic Table Analysis of the Qualitative Studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Halal Tourism Attributes</th>
<th>Management and Government</th>
<th>Development</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Halal Food</td>
<td>Consumer protection</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mohsin et al. (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Halal food souvenirs and branding</td>
<td>Quality of service and food</td>
<td>Addina, Santoslo, &amp; Sucipto (2020), Huda et al. (2021), Kasdi et al. (2021), Mardison et al. (2021),</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Local Islamic Wisdom
- Local spiritual attractions
- Indonesian art and culture
- Tour of Islamic culture and traditions
- Religious tourism

### Halal Tourism Marketing and Technology
- Halal tourism marketing strategy
- Tourist information domain
- Halal tourist locations
- Hybrid DSS
- Redesign of tourist app
- GIS application development
- Web-based GIS and mobile phones
- Halal travel games
- Sharia hotels

### Halal Tourism Regulations
- Legal support
- Local regulations
- Government regulation
- National legal foundations

### Religious Facilities and Activities
- Halal certification results
- Sharia hotel standards
- Hotel Strategy
- Hospitality terms
- Sharia regulation
- Places of worship, worship equipment
- Mosque
- Religious facilities
- Halal food and beverages
- Sharia hotels
- Pilgrimage
- Eco-friendly building

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continuous innovation</th>
<th>Nuraini &amp; Sucipto (2021)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expanding Islamic principles</td>
<td>Nurjaya et al. (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pilgrimage destinations</td>
<td>Palupi et al. (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance of Islamic traditions</td>
<td>Peristiwo (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardian city branding</td>
<td>Yusuf, Djakfar, et al. (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Feel-at-Home&quot; campaign</td>
<td>Bastaman (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy access to information</td>
<td>Izudin et al. (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halal Tourism Map Application</td>
<td>Kasdi et al. (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel culinary recommendations</td>
<td>&quot;Feel-at-Home&quot; campaign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased application users</td>
<td>Samori et al. (2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel boost promotion</td>
<td>Bastaman &amp; Hassan (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Places of worship information</td>
<td>Afnarius, Akbar, &amp; Yuliani (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of a recommendation system</td>
<td>Majid &amp; Arif (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halal certificate</td>
<td>Wardhana et al. (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharia principles</td>
<td>Nurdin &amp; Prasetyo (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic growth</td>
<td>Hafiz &amp; Rosani (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatwa MUI</td>
<td>Zainal, Omar, &amp; Kopong (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qanun Aceh</td>
<td>Mohsin et al. (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive advantage</td>
<td>Zailani, Omar, &amp; Kopong (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of halal certification</td>
<td>Yahaya, Samsudin,, &amp; Kashim (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demand for halal products and services</td>
<td>Razak, Hall, &amp;Prayag (2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic halal tourism</td>
<td>Raof, Mukhtar, Setiawan, &amp;; Hao (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of Halal products and services</td>
<td>Zawawi &amp; Ramli (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharia principles</td>
<td>Abas, Ramli, &amp; David (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human resources</td>
<td>Zulkifli, Ab Rahman, Awang, &amp; Che Man (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous innovation</td>
<td>M. Battour, Hakimian, Ismail, &amp; Boğan (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Guardian</td>
<td>M. M. Battour, Ismail, &amp; Battor (2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy-efficient buildings</td>
<td>Kasdi et al. (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Guardian</td>
<td>Kasdi et al. (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community branding</td>
<td>Kamase et al. (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharia principles</td>
<td>Palupi et al. (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Feel-at-Home&quot; campaign</td>
<td>Rusli, Firmansyah, &amp; Mbulu (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy-efficient buildings</td>
<td>Valeriani et al. (2020)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Malaysia and Indonesia.

### 3.3.1 Halal Food

Halal food is one of the essential attributes of halal tourism. Many Indonesian halal tourism studies discuss halal food, where the discussion is quite broad, from halal food certification to culinary training. However, only one Malaysian halal tourism study has discussed halal food, namely, consumer protection. Mohsin et al. (2016) mentioned that consumer protection in halal tourism related to food, beverages, facilities, and products is vital. Official associations or local government bodies can carry out this protection to maintain sharia compliance and increase trust in halal tourism products, such as JAKIM, based on the MS 1500:2004 standard in Malaysia and the MUI/LPPOM MUI in Indonesia.
Palupi et al. (2017) explained that halal accommodation, the availability of halal food and beverages, human resources, and continuous innovation are factors that can affect the success of the halal tourism industry. In line with the findings of previous studies Joseph et al. (2021), one of the basic goals of halal tourism is to establish a halal place to eat. The management and products served at halal eateries must follow Islamic principles. Halal tourism management needs to consider the management of halal food to improve tourists’ brand image and intention to visit again. Addina et al. (2020) mentioned that the availability of halal food and food souvenirs could increase halal tourism. Food souvenirs can be seen as a unique image and branding as a reminder of a tourist destination. The quality of halal food souvenirs is also influenced by factors focused on the quality of halal food, service, and a Muslim-friendly environment. Promoting halal food is a top priority for hotel, travel, and halal food businesses (Huda et al., 2021).

Indonesia already has patents, logos, and institutions that regulate halal food and carry out internationally recognized certification processes. MUI regulates the special certification of halal products such as food, beverages, medicines, and cosmetics. In comparison, the institution that conducts halal production inspection is LPPOM MUI (Nuraini & Sucipto, 2021). Peristiwi (2020) also added that food and beverages in Indonesia generally receive halal certification from MUI, which is marked with an official halal logo on food and beverage packaging. This halal certification is performed by the Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM) so that the availability of food and beverages is guaranteed to halal tourists.

In addition to maintaining the management and products of halal food following Sharia principles, the development of halal food by providing training for halal food business actors is also significant in halal tourism, as shown in the study by Kasdi et al. (2021), which explained that in 2019 in Kudus, halal food training was held for business actors around tourist attractions. Training toward halal certification was continued in 2020. This halal certification training is held by the Kudus Culture and Tourism Office to maximize the provision of halal food.

### 3.3.2. Local Islamic Wisdom

Local wisdom is an attribute that can attract tourists to a tourist destination. Many Indonesian halal tourism studies have discussed local Islamic wisdom, while in Malaysian halal tourism studies, no one has discussed local wisdom. The identity of local wisdom must be preserved when developing and implementing new tourism. The diversity of this market segment can be increased by expanding Islamic tourism principles and providing new halal tourism concepts such as products, services, tour packages, and traditional attractions. The local wisdom of Islam can be found in many places in Indonesia, such as Bongo Village Gorontalo, a tourism standard with many local attractions based on spiritual values. There are many local traditions in Gorontalo, such as the celebration of the Prophet Muhammad's birthday and nyadran (local practice of the relationship between humans and God and the natural environment) (Izudin et al., 2022). Kasdi et al. (2021) mentioned that art and culture in Kudus are displayed in a Sharia way, as in the kupatan tradition. In addition, Kudus is also famous as a pilgrimage destination and includes the Sunan Kudus Tower Mosque, the Colo Mosque tours, and the Tomb of Sunan Muria. Demak, already known to the public as the City of Guardians, is a tourist destination based on Sharia principles. Many Sharia tourism attractions in Demak include the Great Mosque of Demak, the Sunan Kalijaga Tomb, and the Sultan of Fatah (Kasdi et al., 2018). Then, Bastaman (2018) discussed Lombok Island. Lombok Island is a halal tourist destination in Indonesia that is unique because of its strong Islamic characteristics and background.

### 3.3.3. Marketing and Technology on Halal Tourism

Unlike Indonesian halal tourism studies, which often discuss the application and technology used to support halal tourism in various regions, Malaysian halal studies still do not address technology. However, two Malaysian halal tourism studies were found to be related to halal tourism marketing. The government carries out the marketing and development of halal tourism in Malaysia. Mainly, Malaysia's halal tourism marketing is carried out to attract Muslim tourists from the Middle East. Therefore, a campaign called "Feel-at-Home" by the Malaysian government is used to create facilities that can attract and support halal tourism in Malaysia, such as Jalan Ain Arabia, which provides Middle Eastern food and culture, Arabic signage, and Arabic menus to staff who can use Arabic, provide halal food widely, and create shopping complexes (Samori et al., 2015).

In comparison, halal tourism in Indonesia began to develop in 2011. The Ministry of Tourism then collaborated with MUI and other stakeholders to develop halal tourism. The Ministry of Tourism appointed several areas to develop halal tourism, such as Lombok, Aceh, Bali, Bandung, and West Sumatra. Owing to the development and progress of halal tourism, Indonesia has received many awards related to halal tourism (Bastaman, 2018).

Several studies of Indonesian halal tourism related to technology, such as Wardhana et al. (2018), have been conducted using the Semantic Web Rule Language (SWRL) to help tourists obtain tourism information in Lombok and promote attractions to increase visitor numbers. The ontology and SWRL tests conducted in this study display the information needed by visitors so that it can facilitate user access. Afnarius et al. (2020) also conducted web-based studies and used mobile phones to meet the needs of Muslim travelers. The study data were obtained directly from GPS observations covering places of worship (mosques), hotels, restaurants, tourist destinations, small industries, and public
transportation lines. The results of this test can make it easier for Muslim tourists to find places of worship and other facilities. Moreover, Mardison et al. (2021) studied DSS applications made with the hybrid DSS method. This application aims to make it easier for Muslim tourists to find the best and most economical halal culinary agent in West Sumatra by ranking halal tourism recommendations in West Sumatra.

Afnarius et al. (2020) conducted another study, namely, GIS internet applications in West Sumatra. This application aims to provide the information tourists need about the attractions available in Koto Baru village, South Solok, and West Sumatra, namely, the Thousand Big House tour and other attractions. The developed application also aims to increase tourism promotion in the Thousand Big House area. Study Wibowo et al. (2020) mapped halal tourist sites in Surabaya city using GIS, React Native, NodeJS, and Google Maps as digital map providers. This study uses the RPCA blockchain implemented to ensure the consistency of halal tourism asset data in Surabaya and the PNPOLY method to supervise surveyors’ performance in inputting tourism asset data according to actual conditions in the field. Nahdliyah et al. (2021) redesigned the user interface of a halal tourism application using a user-centered design. This innovation is performed to support halal tourism, which in its development also requires advanced technology by providing a platform with several features that can help Muslim tourists, such as tourist destination information, halal food, prayer schedules, and sharia lodging. Arif et al. (2022) proposed developing a recommendation system through the Indonesian halal tourism game. The study and theme of this game are related to tourist trips in Batu city. Furthermore, Maghrifani (2018) explained that the hotel management strategy is carried out with a "sharia" brand for marketing planning to build a strong sharia image with halal certification from the authorities and showed that the hotel offers adequate facilities for worship, thus creating a friendly Islamic atmosphere.

3.3.4. Halal Tourism Regulations

Regulation is essential for supporting the development of halal tourism in a country. There are many Indonesian halal tourism studies that specifically discuss regulations both nationally and regionally. However, unfortunately, there has been no study on the regulation of Malaysian halal tourism. Effendi et al. (2021) stated that halal tourism regulations only originate from the Fatwa of the DSN-MUI. The government can take steps to obtain legal support in the implementation of halal tourism. Upgrading the status of DSN-MUI’s fatwa to a creative economy regulation and tourism minister is the wisest step for Indonesia. According to him, the legal basis for halal tourism is not comprehensive because the regulations are limited to perfecting the implementation of halal tourism in Indonesia. Therefore, halal tourism still requires principles that can guide tourists and other tourists. Moreover, Adinugraha et al. (2021) explained that the legal basis for the implementation of halal tourism in Indonesia is achieved through the establishment of the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) and local governments by promulgating and regulating established laws and regulations. Fatwa on implementing Sharia-Based Tourism No. 108/DSN-MUI/IX/2016 and NTB Regional Regulation No. 2 of 2016 concerning Halal Tourism. The position of fatwa against Muslims is vital and can be used as a reference because fatwa was compiled and issued by authorities in the field of religion. Study A. K. Jaelani et al. (2020) also added that the legal basis for the birth of NTB Provincial Regional Regulation No. 2 of 2016 was the attribution and ratification of Article 18(6) of the 1945 Constitution, Article 9 of Law No. 10 of 2009 related to tourism, Article 12 paragraph 3 letter b and Article 236 of Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Special Area Government and Article 5 of Ministerial Regulation No. 2 of 2014 Tourism and Creative Economy Guidelines for the Application of Sharia for Hotel Business. Furthermore, the sociological basis for implementing the Halal Tourism Regional Regulation is the population and population aspects of West Nusa Tenggara Province, which strongly support the implementation of Halal Tourism.

In another study, Purwandani and Yusuf (2021) explained that each region can practice its halal tourism method and has values embraced by those who practice it or the local community. The development of halal tourism cannot be separated from the local community that supports it and must be accomplished by considering local communities, principles, and customs. For example, Padang refers to customary law and sharia to regulate tourism, while Aceh has legalized sharia to regulate tourism. Aceh has a set of provincial legal regulations called Qanun. Researchers Joseph et al. (2021) added that the Aceh government has issued a government regulation, namely, Qanun Aceh, on tourism activities that adhere to Islamic values religion, and the central government has approved the application of sharia. This study can improve the economic development of local communities in the halal tourism industry without contradicting Sharia principles. The economy will also grow if tourism players and stakeholders support it. The economic growth of people dependent on the tourism industry will be more substantial when the government and banks fully support infrastructure development, capital provision and reliable human resources in the halal tourism sector.

In another study, Antoni et al. (2019) discussed how economic growth contributes to the growth of the tourism industry in West Sumatra. The government promotes tourism as one of the primary industries for increasing revenue at home and abroad. According to Nurjaya et al. (2020), the use of the term “halal tourism” is still diverse and debated. Similarly, halal tourism’s main principles and requirements have not been agreed upon.

3.3.4. Tourism Facilities and Religious Activities
Many Malaysian and Indonesian halal tourism studies discuss tourist facilities. Some Indonesian halal tourism studies also discuss religious activities, but no Malaysian study has discussed this topic. Malaysian halal tourism studies discuss most tourist facilities in the hospitality field. Like Malaysian halal tourism studies, which discuss many tourist facilities, Indonesian studies also discuss many. However, the broader discussion is not limited to only the hospitality field. Sharia hotels are among the few Islamic travel frameworks in addition to halal standards, food, Islamic travel packages, halal transportation, and Islamic finance (Zulkifli et al., 2011). However, several terms are related to hotels, for example, sharia hotels and Muslim-friendly hotels. Zawawi and Ramli (2017) explained that Sharia and Muslim-friendly hotels differ. Sharia hotels focus not only on services and products such as halal food and beverages and worship facilities in hotel rooms but also on their overall operations. In addition, hospitality facilities must also comply with Sharia rules, such as the prohibition of alcohol, the separation of male and female facilities, and the prohibition of forms of entertainment that can invite sin (Battour et al., 2010). There are several regulations and standards related to hospitality operations in Malaysia. The Malaysian government has provided guidelines and requirements for managing tourism facilities, products, and services for Muslim tourists, namely, MS2610:2015 (Abas et al., 2017). In addition to MS2610:2015, there are other halal hotel standards, as disclosed Yahaya et al. (2020), namely, the Salam Standard and Crescentrating Standard. When adapted to the concept of maqashid sharia, these three standards are not holistic. These standards do not address certain factors, such as protecting life and property, in maqashid sharia.

Razak et al. (2019) reported that halal hotel accommodation service providers interpret halal requirements according to their understanding of halal hospitality. They see halal hospitality as a business opportunity because most of their visitors are Muslims; thus, they adjust their business by making it a halal hotel. Although some accommodation providers are willing to adapt their businesses to halal hotels to attract visitors, some are not interested in applying for halal certification. Zailani et al. (2011) revealed that some respondents stated that their hotel business remains successful without halal hotel certification because most visitors are non-Muslims. This situation means that the perceived benefits of halal certification are a factor in why some hotel accommodation providers do not apply for halal certification. The disinterest of some hotel accommodation providers in doing their business in a Sharia hotel is understandable because making a hotel into a Sharia hotel also incurs an enormous cost, as expressed by Raof et al. (2022). Implementing the concept of a halal hotel or a local authority-compliant hotel requires proper planning and substantial funds to provide sharia-compliant facilities and services, such as separate swimming pools between men and women. The application of this concept to hotels also has an impact on decreasing hotel revenue, which is generated mainly through the sale of food and beverages such as alcohol. From the perspective of non-Muslims visiting halal tourist destinations in Malaysia and Turkey, M. Battour et al. (2018) explained that halal tourism providers must prepare innovative facilities, products, and services that can satisfy not only Muslim tourists but also non-Muslims. Although non-Muslims’ perceptions of halal tourism are quite positive, some people have negative perceptions because they believe that strict halal tourism rules will cause them to lose the freedom to enjoy their visit. For example, concerning halal food rules that prevent them from eating certain foods and alcohol, innovative solutions are needed.

In a study of the management and development of tourism facilities, Valerani et al. (2020) explained that halal tourist destinations are Muslim friendly tours equipped with the necessary facilities for Muslim tourists. The facilities that must be available at halal tourist attractions include mosques, separate male and female holy places, Qibla directions in hotels, and prayer facilities. According to Rusli et al. (2018), halal tourist destinations provide Muslim-friendly services, safe travel, halal food, and airport services and facilities. Palupi et al. (2017) added that an essential factor in halal tourism is the availability of Muslim-friendly airports, such as musalas with clean water. Human resources are also an essential asset in the halal tourism industry. Continuous innovation efforts to survive and satisfy Muslim tourists in all aspects, such as service, technology, and halal tour packages, are critical. According to Kasdi et al. (2021), halal tourist attractions must have worship facilities and infrastructure that are suitable for use, easily accessible, and follow Islamic requirements, such as tourist attractions in Kudus, which have been equipped with worship facilities and infrastructure so that visitors can know when prayer time has arrived and can carry out worship on time. Kasdi et al. (2018) explained that halal provisions apply to food and hostels or hotels that do not use alcohol and have separate swimming pools and spa facilities for men and women. In addition, Kamase et al. (2021) examined new developments in the Ivory Coast region of Lombok, West Nusa Tenggara (NTB). This study was conducted to support tourism and develop coastal areas that benefit the environment and improve visitors’ health, comfort, and well-being. Five principles of sustainable design are applied in Côte d’Ivoire: place, community, health, materials, and energy.

4. Final considerations

The results of this study show that the earliest Malaysian halal tourism study found in Scopus occurred in 2010, during which the number of articles increased continuously until it peaked. The earliest Indonesian halal tourism study was conducted in 2017, and the number of studies peaked in 2021. Regarding quantitative studies, the most widely used theoretical framework in studying halal tourism in both countries is customer behavior theory, followed by halal tourism...
theory. Halal tourism studies of both countries can still develop their studies using theoretical frameworks that have not been used, such as grounded theory. In the study of Indonesian halal tourism, the most widely used theme is tourist behavior. These studies examine what attributes or things affect the specific behavior of tourists, such as satisfaction, intention to visit again, and intention to recommend a tourist destination (WOM). However, many halal tourism themes have not been studied in Malaysian halal tourism research. Almost all the themes discussed in Malaysian halal tourism studies, such as hospitality, tourist perceptions of halal tourism, attributes, and halal tourism marketing, have also been discussed. Many themes of Indonesian halal tourism studies, such as regulatory themes, halal tourism technology, halal food, halal tourism business, and halal tourism development studies, have not been found in Malaysian halal tourism studies. This phenomenon may be due to the unequal number of halal tourism studies involved, where only 18 Malaysian and 61 Indonesian halal tourism studies were found, causing a large difference from the number of themes discussed in halal tourism studies.

**Ethical considerations**

Not applicable.

**Conflict of interest**

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

**Funding**

This research did not receive any financial support.

**Reference**


